MR. SPEAKER: If you are not going to speak, ask someone else to speak. You have the same matter before the House. Stiil you want to raise it now.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This is what happens when you do not stick to the rules And then you object also.

SHRI HANNAN MOLLAH: This is serious problem. This kind of transfer is creating a problem for the nation. You know how the Chairmen are appointed. The Finance Ministry sends it to the Cabinet Committee and the Home Ministery gives the clearance. You will be surprised to know that the Home Minister suggested one name and the Finance Minster rejected that ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am not allowing this kind of a thing. Appointments and transfers are not to be discussed here.

SHRI HANNAN MOLLAH: The Home Minister and the Finance Minister are quarrelling...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please understand that transfers and appointments of the officers are not the matters to be discussed on the floor of the House. Please understand the rules.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This is not going on record.

(*Interruptions*)*

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Ram Naik.

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM NAIK (Bombay North): Mr. Speaker, Sir, there was an advertisement in the 'Navbharat Times' of 16th December under the heading-Navbharat Times in Parliament. A discussion had already taken place in this House regarding the Navbharat Times group on a previous occasion about which I had given a notice of Privilege Motion. In that notice I had stated that it was against the dignity of the House to give such an advertisement. You had also observed that it was an important issue and you would look into it. You might have written to them seeking an explanation about their reaction and you would apprise the House of it later. But today a news-item has appeared again on the first page of the Navbharat Times and on the basis of that news item it has been tried again to lower to prestige of the hon. Members of this House. That is why, I am again giving a notice of the Motion of Privilege to you. In that news-item it has been stated that the photo that had appeared on the 12th July....

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: I will look into it.

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM NAIK:.....and now fettering to that photo, it has been said that at present it seems that to derive any wrong interpretation from this photo might be based on irrelevant factors only. It means that the question raised by us here is based on extraneous reasons, unreasonable reasons. It has tried to make such an allegation against us.

I tried to go through the Navbharat Times of 12th July to find out as to what that news-item really is. There was photo of metro in it. That photo was presented in such a way in the form of a news-item that it cast direct as persions on us. Our objection was that it was used in the form of an advertisement. They

*Not recorded.

have again tried to mislead the House today.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: I will look into it.

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM NAIK: Left me finish, Sir, I mean to say that whatever has appeared in it today is an attempt to mislead the House on that basis. Both these matters of misleading the House as well as casting aspirations on the hon. Members are very serious matters. Therefore, I would like to submit to you to refer this entire matter to the Privilege Committee as this matter has already been discussed in the House.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, you will look into this matter of privilege and will take action on it but I would like to present the entire episode of the Navbharat Times in details before the Government Whatever is taking place now-a-days there or had taken place in last few months weakens the most important pillar of democracy in our country.The most important pillar of democracy is freedom of expression-and the freedom of journalists is important part of it. But for the last 5-6 moths, it seems that an effort is being made to systematically end the editorial independence. It appears that publishing a newspaper is only a matter of commerce and industry. I accept that it has financial aspects also. Journalism is also an industry, it is business but it is not purely a business.

These days the editors and eminent journalists of that newspaper have been humiliated and removed one after another. The editor of Delhi branch Shri S.P. Singh, the Chief of Bureau of Delhi...(*Interruptions*) Two Senior Editors of Delhi, one of Lucknow and one of Patna came to me...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: We will not discuss such things here.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: When this question was raised here four days ago, it was expected that the Government would make a statement but it did not do so.The session is going to be over. I would like to say that not only the journalists of the Navbharat Times or The Times of India but journalists of the entire country are very much agitated on the issue. During his reply to the discussion on terrorism the day before yesterday, the Home Minister had said that:

[*English*]

> "We requested the Press Council of India to nominate their representatives; send them to Jammu and Kashmir to go into the allegations which have been made."

[*Translation*]

It means that if the Government finds any matter important, it requests the Press Council of India to send its representative to find out whether there has been actual infringement of human rights, as the people say. Then Shri Verghese was sent there.

I submit that the House and the Government should decide to constitute a Committee of the House to look into the entire Navbharat Tims episode because this is not only the question of freedom of journalism but is an important issue concerned with the linguistic journalism. No one, who has faith in democracy, can ever tolerate to see meekly the attacks being made on language newspapers. I would suggest that either a Committee of the House should be constituted or the Government should advise the Press Council of India to get it investigated fully and submit a report so that proper action can be taken in this regard. This is my submission.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: I support what our friend and the leader of the Opposition has said just now.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: There is no need for everyone to repeat the same thing.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Then you don't allow.

MR. SPEAKER: I allow one by one. Otherwise it becomes irregular discussion. How will it do if all the Members start speaking.

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: I was the first person to meet you in the Chamber. I had requested you and had also said that it is not good to raise this issue again and again... The Government should be serious about what it says on this matter. The hon. Minister gave the reply but it was only to protect the management. I want to say only this what is appearing in newspaper is very serious.

MR. SPEAKER: This is a matter of privilege.

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: You should give an early decision on the matter of privilege. Every day the Members are espressing concern on the entire episode. Yesterday, Shri V.P. Singh expressed concern on it. Today he has expressed concern. The entire House has expressed its concern on it. A Committee of the House should be constituted consisting of the representative of the Government, jouralists and management personnel to look into the matter.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: No one has objection to the freedom of expression of journalists. A provision of the Press Council has been made in our Constitution. If any of the journalists has any type of complaints or he has a complaint on a related matter, the Press Council is the right forum for that. Complaints should be made to them. They have a right to hear it. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI RAM KAPSE (Thane): What about the privilege issue?

[*Translation*]

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: No one has any objection to the freedom of expression of journalists but what action did they take when the members of the Akhil Bhartiya Vidyarthi Parishad threw stones at the journalists in Indore and prevented them from doing their work. The journalists are still on strike. In Madhya Pradesh what action the BJP. Government is taking... (*Interruptions*)... Tell your State Government about those who are misbehaving with the journalists there...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. SPEAKER: I would like to tell you in this regard that comments have been called for on the earlier Privilege Motion. Your notice is also there. Appropriate action will be taken after investigating the matter.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SURAJ MANDAL (Godda): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I did not get an opportunity to speak yesterday nor have I got it today...(*Interruptions*)...

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: It is not proper for you, Mr. Mandal, to shout like this all the time. I have allowed you many times. Please sit down now. It is not proper for a Member to